Transportation Planning Certification Review of the Boston Region Metropolitan Planning Organization, Final Report - April 24, 2019 Table 1: Summary of Federal Corrective Actions and MPO Responses:

FTA & FHWA Corrective Actions	MPO Response & Proposed Action(s)	Responsibility	Due Date	Status as of August 7, 2019
Key Metropolitan Transportation Planning Documents and Processes				
1. List of Obligated Projects				
In coordination with MassDOT and public transit operators, develop and publish a complete listing of obligated projects within 90 days after the close of the federal fiscal year. Include the approved amount programmed in the TIP, the total amount obligated, and the remaining balance for each project. This will ensure that the list of obligated projects fully meets all the required elements per 23 CFR 450.334.	BRMPO staff have posted the FFY 2018 highway obligated projects list to the BRMPO web page, and have requested information on FFY 2018 obligated projects from the MWRTA, CATA, and the MBTA. BRMPO staff will work with MassDOT, the MBTA, and the regional transit authorities to post a complete listing of obligated projects within 90 days after the close of the federal fiscal year.	MassDOT, MBTA, MWRTA, and CATA	December 30, 2019, and ongoing	MassDOT, MBTA, MWRTA, and CATA Action Required BRMPO staff have provided a detailed request for the required information to the MBTA and the RTAs. BRMPO staff have received the list of FFY 2018 obligated transit projects from the MBTA and is awaiting responses from MetroWest and CATA. Staff intend to post the list of FFY 2018 obligated transit projects in August 2019 and the list of all (highway and transit) FFY 2019 projects by December 30, 2019.
2. Air Quality			l	
Update MOU between the MPOs, MassDOT, the Department of Environmental Protection (DEP), and providers of public transportation to include current requirements and the specific requirements of the South Coast Air Quality Management District vs. EPA ruling.	The MassDOT-developed draft MOU update was presented and reviewed with staff from all MPOs in the Commonwealth, FHWA, FTA, EPA, and DEP at the annual air quality consultation meeting on March 6, 2019. At that meeting, MassDOT requested any additional comments or suggested edits within two weeks. DEP started a review by its general counsel and needed a longer comment period. MassDOT received a response from DEP on June 5, 2019. Since that time, MassDOT has worked with DEP to	MassDOT, MPOs, and DEP	September 30, 2019	MassDOT, MPOs, and DEP Action Required In process; expected completion August 2019.

FTA & FHWA Corrective Actions	MPO Response & Proposed Action(s)	Responsibility	Due Date	Status as of August 7, 2019
	iron out remaining points of clarification. The revised draft is being distributed to the MPOs for their final review and signature. The expected timing of final MOU completion is early August 2019.			

Transportation Planning Certification Review of the Boston Region Metropolitan Planning Organization, Final Report - April 24, 2019 Table 2: Summary of Federal Recommendations and MPO Responses:

FTA & FHWA Recommendations	MPO Response & Proposed Action(s)	Responsibility	Target Date(s)	Status as of August 7, 2019
Key Metropolitan Transportation Planning Documents and Processes				
Metropolitan Transportation Plan				
a. Include a description of performance measures and targets used in assessing the performance of the transportation system in accordance with 23 CFR 450.306(d). Include a system performance report evaluating progress in meeting performance targets.	The BRMPO MTP, <i>Destination 2040</i> , to be adopted in August 2019, includes a system performance report as required by federal legislation. It will include a description of performance measures and targets adopted by the BRMPO as of March 2019.	BRMPO	October 1, 2019	In process
	Performance reports in future LRTPs will describe the BRMPO's progress in meeting these initial targets.		October 1, 2023	
b. Integrate in the MTP the goals, objectives, performance measures and targets described in other transportation planning documents, such as the	The <i>Destination 2040</i> MTP incorporates the goals, objectives, performance measures, and targets described in MassDOT's TAMP, TAM, HSIP, and freight transportation planning documents.	BRMPO	October 1, 2019	In process
transportation asset management plan (TAMP), highway safety improvement program (HSIP), Freight Plan, transit asset management (TAM) plan and others as applicable.	Performance reports in future LRTPs will describe the BRMPO's progress in meeting these initial targets.		October 1, 2023	
2. TIP		•		
Include specific descriptions of the anticipated effect of the TIP toward achieving the performance targets	The Performance Analysis chapter of the FFYs 2020—24 TIP details the BRMPO's targets for federally required performance	BRMPO	N/A	Complete

FTA & FHWA Recommendations	MPO Response & Proposed Action(s)	Responsibility	Target Date(s)	Status as of August 7, 2019
and linking investment priorities to those performance targets.	measures and describes how the projects in the TIP are expected to make progress towards these targets. BRMPO staff will continue to improve these descriptions in future TIP development cycles.			
3. Financial Planning			•	
In cooperation with MassDOT and the other MPOs, explore updating the Massachusetts Association of Regional Planning Agencies (MARPA) formula to reflect current inputs (i.e., population and road mileage).	BRMPO staff discussed this issue with MassDOT.	MassDOT, BRMPO, and other Massachusetts MPOs	October 2021	MARPA Action Required
Congestion Management Process				
Develop and implement a process for periodic assessment of implemented strategies to better inform decision-making on potential congestion management strategies in the future. This should include evaluating projects and strategies beyond those that have been constructed with BRMPO target funds.	BRMPO staff will perform before and after studies to evaluate congestion and safety strategies at recently completed BRMPO TIP-funded and other locations.	BRMPO	December 31, 2020	BRMPO included a before and after study in the FFY 2020 UPWP and plans to commence work in late 2019.
5. Air Quality				
Ensure all files associated with air quality conformity are readily available, should the public or another entity request to review (i.e., Motor Vehicle Emission Simulator (MOves) input files, Conformity SIP).	MassDOT is responsible for determining conformity for Massachusetts; because of this, staff believe that MassDOT should be responsible for storing and archiving MOVES inputs and resulting emission factors. Staff recommend that MassDOT provide the	MassDOT and MPOs	December 31, 2019	MassDOT Action Required BRMPO staff will coordinate with MassDOT to link the BRMPO's website to the appropriate MassDOT files.

FTA & FHWA Recommendations	MPO Response & Proposed Action(s)	Responsibility	Target Date(s)	Status as of August 7, 2019
	MOVES inputs and resulting factors on its website, and BRMPO and other Massachusetts MPOs would provide a link from their websites to this MassDOT site.			
Coordinated, Cooperative, and Comprehensive Planning Process				
6. MPO Organizational Structure				
a. Develop an operations plan, as called for in the MOU. An operations plan should clarify roles and responsibilities among BRMPO members and staff, particularly among CTPS, MAPC, and MassDOT, pertaining to collaboration, communication, work assignments, and products. Additionally, it should provide further clarification on the roles of the Chair and Vice Chair, define officer roles for subcommittees, and identify other necessary processes to support an effective 3C process and facilitate BRMPO operations as the regional forum for transportation decision-making.	BRMPO staff will work with BRMPO board members and/or a subcommittee to determine an approach to developing an operations plan. Once the approach is determined, BRMPO staff will support the development of an operations plan.	BRMPO	January 2020 January 2021	BRMPO Action Required
b. Review voting procedures for BRMPO Board seats to ensure that all communities in the region are effectively engaged and they result in effective representation.	BRMPO staff will work with the Metropolitan Area Planning Council (the Vice Chair of the BRMPO), MassDOT, and BRMPO members and/or a subcommittee to review the voting procedures.	BRMPO	January 2021	BRMPO Action Required

FTA & FHWA Recommendations	MPO Response & Proposed Action(s)	Responsibility	Target Date(s)	Status as of August 7, 2019
c. Seek to broaden the information and training opportunities available to the board members about current best practices in transportation planning.	BRMPO staff will work with BRMPO members to identify appropriate information and training opportunities related to best practices in the field of regional transportation planning and new technologies and trends that are influencing the field.	BRMPO	Ongoing	Webinar scheduled on July 30, 2019: "Integrating Shared Mobility into Multimodal Transportation Planning: Metropolitan Area Case Studies."
	BRMPO staff recently contributed to a case study report published by the Federal Highway Administration entitled "Integrating Shared Mobility into Multimodal Transportation Planning: Metropolitan Area Case Studies;" as part of this, BRMPO staff, in coordination with MAPC, are presenting on a webinar on July 30, 2019. BRMPO staff intend to notify BRMPO members of this learning opportunity.			
	BRMPO staff will continue to look for learning/training opportunities for BRMPO members.			
Public Outreach and Public Involvement	L			
Refine efforts to measure the effectiveness of public involvement strategies.	BRMPO staff are working to develop a more robust approach to tracking outreach strategies by type, populations reached, and outcomes. Staff are researching best practices used by other MPOs and will be testing new approaches to and methods for evaluating the effectiveness of various outreach strategies this summer (2019). Staff will continually refine these efforts as we continue to learn from our peers, test new approaches, and research best practices.	BRMPO	Ongoing	BRMPO staff are currently planning summer 2019 outreach and are actively working on an outreach-tracking database and improved outreach effectiveness analysis measures.

FTA & FHWA Recommendations	MPO Response & Proposed Action(s)	Responsibility	Target Date(s)	Status as of August 7, 2019
b. Establish a social media policy that makes clear to the public how comments received through social media will be used, i.e., whether or not they will become part of the public record and be considered for incorporation into plans and projects.	BRMPO staff are working on drafting a social media policy.	BRMPO	December 2019	In process
Transit Planning			•	
 a. Refine the TIP project selection and prioritization process in consideration of the following: Developing a clear, modeneutral process by which transit projects, including, but not limited to, bus priority projects, can be planned and programmed with consideration for all eligible funding sources. Clarifying in public documents how the MPO evaluates proposed project lists from MassDOT and the MBTA, (for inclusion in the TIP), how these proposals address the targets which have been adented for 	It is BRMPO staff practice to work with the BRMPO to revise its TIP project selection criteria after the adoption of new goals and objectives in the LRTP. The next LRTP is scheduled to be endorsed by the BRMPO in August 2019, and BRMPO staff's work to revise TIP project selection criteria began in June 2019. Since the BRMPO may adopt a Transit Modernization Investment Program and a Dedicated Bus Lane Investment Program (subset of the existing Complete Streets Investment Program) in the new LRTP, BRMPO staff will focus on developing TIP project evaluation criteria that allow the BRMPO to analyze and prioritize future projects that fall into these investment categories.	BRMPO	March 2020 (for revised BRMPO TIP criteria)	BRMPO staff have initiated work to revise the TIP project selection criteria.
have been adopted for Performance Based Planning and Programming, and how the CIP and TIP project selection processes are aligned.	Chapter 2 of the FFYs 2020–24 TIP clarifies how the BRMPO considers MassDOT and MBTA projects proposed for the TIP. The BRMPO does not currently evaluate these projects in the same way that they do the group of TIP projects funded with regional target funds. Projects proposed by MassDOT		N/A	Complete (for clarification of BRMPO evaluation of MassDOT and MBTA TIP projects and explanation of the alignment between CIP and TIP project selection processes).

FTA & FHWA Recommendations	MPO Response & Proposed Action(s)	Responsibility	Target Date(s)	Status as of August 7, 2019
	and the MBTA are evaluated with criteria established by the PSAC. While the BRMPO currently uses project selection criteria that are different from MassDOT's PSAC criteria, the BRMPO develops project criteria with consideration of the PSAC criteria. The impact of this coordination is that all funded projects in the region (regionally funded/prioritized and state funded/prioritized) are prioritized in a way that moves the region towards the common goals and objectives of the BRMPO and MassDOT.			
	Chapter 2 of the TIP also describes how the CIP and TIP project selection processes are aligned.			
	Chapter 4 of the FFYs 2020–24 TIP explains and analyzes how investments, both regionally prioritized and state prioritized, address the targets adopted for Performance-Based Planning and Programming.		Ongoing (for analysis of how TIP programming addresses adopted Performance-Based Planning and Programming targets)	
b. The BRMPO, MassDOT, and MBTA should develop a consolidated list of ferryboat funding in the TIP, such as a separate summary table, including FBP funds, any discretionary funds awarded to the region, and 5307 and 5337 funds allocated for ferry capital	BRMPO staff will work with MassDOT, the MBTA, and other stakeholders to develop a consolidated list of ferryboat funding in the TIP.	BRMPO, MassDOT, and MBTA	May 2020 and ongoing	BRMPO, MassDOT, and MBTA Action Required BRMPO staff have reached out to MassDOT and the MBTA to obtain the list of ferryboat funding.

FTA & FHWA Recommendations	MPO Response & Proposed Action(s)	Responsibility	Target Date(s)	Status as of August 7, 2019
projects.				
c. The MBTA and CTPS should use their combined expertise in reporting to the NTD to identify any other eligible services within the TMA which could be voluntary reporters and contribute to the state's formula fund apportionment, including, but not limited to, ferry operators, intercity bus operators, and municipal transit systems.	BRMPO staff will work with MassDOT Rail and Transit and the MBTA to identify potential voluntary NTD reporters.	MassDOT, MBTA, and CTPS	July 2020	
Title VI and Nondiscrimination Data Collection and Analysis				
a. Complete further analysis to ensure that the transportation needs of Title VI and EJ communities are being met.	BRMPO staff will continue to explore and implement additional ways to determine if the transportation needs of Title VI and EJ populations are being met.	BRMPO	Ongoing	Ongoing
b. Develop disparate impact/disproportionate thresholds as referenced in the MTP. Accurate thresholds are critical to ensuring and demonstrating equitable transportation planning.	In May 2019, the BRMPO completed phase one of developing a methodology to identify potential DI/DBs. In this first phase, staff identified the forecasting error for each metric used to determine DI/DBs. BRMPO staff will conduct a UPWP study in FFY 2020 to complete phase two, which will develop a threshold for each metric.	BRMPO	September 2020	Phase one of developing DI/DB thresholds is complete. Work on phase two will begin October 1, 2019.
c. Update the website to publicize the findings/recommendations or status update of the DI/DB policy working group. The participating stakeholders may feel their efforts to be heard	The BRMPO website includes the findings and recommendations of the DI/DB Policy Working Group and the resulting draft DI/DB Policy, and references plans to refine the draft policy in FFY 2020.	BRMPO	N/A	Complete

FTA & FHWA Recommendations	MPO Response & Proposed Action(s)	Responsibility	Target Date(s)	Status as of August 7, 2019
were futile and become discouraged from participating in future events.				
Title VI and Nondiscrimination Outreach, Access & Limited English Proficiency (LEP)				
Continue to implement innovative outreach techniques designed to engage traditionally underserved Title VI/EJ populations. The targeted outreach efforts can include participating in special events that may not have a transportation focused agenda but are held in LEP communities.	BRMPO staff will identify and implement new ways to engage Title VI and EJ populations in BRMPO activities, especially people with limited English proficiency. BRMPO staff will continue to attend special events in communities around the region, using innovative engagement tools and evaluating outreach efforts.	BRMPO	Ongoing	Staff are continuing to implement innovative methods to improve engagement with Title VI and EJ populations.
Planning Focus Areas				
Environmental Mitigation				
Address resiliency of the transportation system in the MTP and TIP selection criteria; and seek other opportunities to emphasize the importance of resiliency in transportation planning and programming of projects.	The BRMPO incorporated resiliency into its current MTP, Charting Progress to 2040, as part of its Needs Assessment under the System Preservation goal. It was also included in the evaluation of projects for the recommended MTP under that goal area, rating projects on the ability to improve emergency response and respond to extreme conditions. The new Destination 2040 MTP has strengthened resiliency in multiple areas of the MTP and Needs Assessment documents. The BRMPO broadened its System Preservation and Modernization goal to specifically include resiliency in its goal statement and continued to include it in the objectives. It expanded	BRMPO	March 2020 for TIP selection criteria	Complete for MTP. The BRMPO is revisiting its TIP project evaluation criteria.

FTA & FHWA Recommendations	MPO Response & Proposed Action(s)	Responsibility	Target Date(s)	Status as of August 7, 2019
	resiliency in the Needs Assessment and expanded its Complete Streets program to include resiliency investments as an eligible project type for TIP funding. With this new goal and the related objectives, the BRMPO will revisit its TIP project evaluation criteria beginning in the summer of 2019 to reflect the enhanced focus on resiliency and to account properly for projects that prioritize resiliency investments.			
Performance-Based Planning and Programming				
a. Performance Dashboard website should distinguish what content is related to federal performance measures and what is not related to federal performance measures. Throughout planning documents, ensure that performance measures, metrics, and related data and information are clearly defined and not conflicting.	BRMPO staff will review and update the Performance Dashboard and provide notes about whether specific content on the various pages relates to federally required performance measures. BRMPO staff will review planning documents during development cycles and make any necessary clarifications or text additions to ensure that performance measures, metrics, and related data and information are clearly and consistently defined. Where necessary, staff will provide explanations and define relationships between measures so they do not appear to be in conflict.	BRMPO	December 1, 2019 June 30, 2020	
b. The BRMPO, MassDOT, and providers of public transportation should evaluate existing planning agreements for any necessary updates regarding the roles and responsibilities for performance data, information sharing, target selection, and performance	The most recent coordination agreement for the Boston UZA was fully executed in January 2019, and the Performance-Based Planning and Programming Agreement for MassDOT, Massachusetts MPOs, and transit agencies was executed in April 2019. These recent agreements accounted for roles and responsibilities for data and information sharing, target selection, and performance	BRMPO, MassDOT, and RTAs	September 30, 2019	

FTA & FHWA Recommendations	MPO Response & Proposed Action(s)	Responsibility	Target Date(s)	Status as of August 7, 2019
reporting.	reporting. BRMPO staff may suggest updates for MassDOT and other signatories of these agreements to consider, as needed. BRMPO staff will also coordinate with MassDOT on any performance-related terms that should be incorporated into the updated Air Quality Agreement.			
Freight Planning		,		
Consider adopting a routine cycle to updating the Freight Action Plan.	BRMPO staff propose to prepare regular Freight Action Plan updates quadrennially to ensure that the Action Plan reflects the current needs of the BRMPO.	BRMPO	Ongoing	An update has been completed and is scheduled to be presented to the BRMPO in July 2019.
Connected and Autonomous Vehicles and Transportation Network Company				
a. Include rideshare CAVs into long-term planning activities.	BRMPO staff will continue to engage with stakeholders, academia, and other government entities to understand how TNCs and CAV technology will affect transportation planning in the region. Staff will work with MassDOT and the DPU to request information from TNCs and rideshare providers. Staff will explore new data sets and tools as a means to facilitate scenario planning and research opportunities concerning this topic in the Boston region.	BRMPO	Ongoing	BRMPO staff monitor developments in technology, data sets, research, and tools to understand how TNCs and CAVs should be incorporated into the BRMPO's long-term planning activities. Staff are currently exploring the BRMPO participation in a pilot study for a NCHRP 20-102(09) research project about TNC modeling tools.
b. Explore opportunities to more formally integrate rideshare and CAV interest into the RTAC, stakeholder working committees, etc. This could include representation from Massachusetts Department of	BRMPO staff will conduct outreach to groups representing rideshare and CAV interests with the goal of getting them involved in RTAC. In addition, staff will solicit RTAC member interest in presentations concerning state of the practice and the BRMPO's efforts to	BRMPO	January 2020 and ongoing	BRMPO staff are conducting membership outreach, which will include groups representing rideshare and CAV interests, this summer.

FTA & FHWA Recommendations	MPO Response & Proposed Action(s)	Responsibility	Target Date(s)	Status as of August 7, 2019
Public Utilities, neighborhood associations, and/or the business community.	incorporate rideshare services in long-term planning.			

3C = Coordinated, Cooperative, and Comprehensive Planning Process. BRMPO = Boston Region Massachusetts Planning Organization. CATA = Cape Ann Transportation Authority. CAV = Connected and Autonomous Vehicles. CIP = Capital Investment Plan. DEP = Massachusetts Department of Environmental Protection. DI/DB = disparate impacts and disproportionate burdens. DPU = Department of Public Utilities. EJ = Environmental Justice. EPA = US Environmental Protection Agency. FBP = Construction of Ferry Boats and Ferry Terminal Facilities Formula Program. FFY = Federal Fiscal Year. FHWA = Federal Highway Administration. FTA = Federal Transit Authority. HSIP = highway safety improvement program. LRTP = Long-Range Transportation Plan. MARPA = Massachusetts Association of Regional Planning Agencies. MassDOT = Massachusetts Department of Transportation. MBTA = Massachusetts Bay Transportation Authority. MOU = Memorandum of Understanding. MPO = Metropolitan Planning Organization. MTP = Metropolitan Transportation Plan. MWRTA = MetroWest Regional Transit Authority. NCHRP = National Cooperative Highway Research Program. NTD = National Transit Database. PSAC = Project Selection Advisory Council. RTA = regional transit authority. RTAC = Regional Transportation Advisory Council. TAMP = transportation network company. UPWP = Unified Planning Work Program. UZA = Urbanized Area.